Impact of Rankings & Personalized Recommendations in Marketplaces

Omar Besbes

Yash Kanoria

Akshit Kumar

Columbia Business School

Columbia Business School

Columbia Business School

We study a stylized model to isolate & understand the impact of different information provisioning tools -- (public) rankings and (personalized) recommendations -- with & without supply constraints.



Fundamental interplay between the value proposition of these information provisioning tools & supply side capacity constraints



In uncapacitated settings, both tools provide benefit with their relative value depending on the level of preference heterogeneity

Model & Information Regimes



In capacitated setting, public rankings provide little value while personalized recommendations provide most of the value.

Agents' utility model

- $U(a,i) = (1-\rho) \cdot q(i) + \rho \cdot \varphi(a,i)$
- $\bullet q(i)$: Common term depends only on the item i
- $\phi(a,i)$: Idiosyncratic term depends on the agent-item (a,i) pair
- •ρ: level of heterogeneity in utility (preference heterogeneity)

Uncapacitated: n agents and n items and each item has ∞ capacity

Capacitated: n agents and n items and each item has unit capacity

Measure of interest: Expected average utility across agents

Agents choose items Agents choose items Agents choose based solely on the

No Info Partial Info

Full Info

 $U(a,i) = (1-\rho) \cdot q(i)$ $U(a,i) = (1 - \rho) \cdot q(i)$ $U(a,i) = (1 - \rho) \cdot q(i)$ Personalized Recos **Public Rankings**

Results

We have n agents and n items. Assume that the common terms q(i) and the idiosyncratic terms $\varphi(a,i)$ are drawn i.i.d from distributions F_a and F_{ω} and both are independent of each other.

If F_a and F_{aa} are bounded dist.

$$\Delta_{\emptyset \to q}^{\text{cap}} = 0$$
 $\Delta_{\emptyset \to q}^{\text{uncap}} \simeq (1 - \rho) \cdot (b - \mu)$

$$\Delta_{q \to u}^{\text{cap}} \simeq \rho \cdot (b - \mu)$$
 $\Delta_{q \to u}^{\text{uncap}} \simeq \rho \cdot (b - \mu)$

If F_a and F_{a} have exponential tails

$$\Delta_{\emptyset \to q}^{\text{cap}} = 0$$
 $\Delta_{\emptyset \to q}^{\text{uncap}} \simeq (1 - \rho) \cdot \ln n$

$$\Delta_{q \to u}^{\text{cap}} \simeq \rho \cdot \ln n \quad \Delta_{q \to u}^{\text{uncap}} \simeq \max\{0, 2\rho - 1\} \cdot \ln n \quad \Delta_{q \to u}^{\text{cap}} \simeq c\rho \cdot n^{1/\alpha} \quad \Delta_{q \to u}^{\text{uncap}} \simeq c(g(\alpha, \rho)) \cdot n^{1/\alpha}$$

If F_a and F_{ω} have Pareto tails

$$\Delta_{\emptyset \to q}^{\text{cap}} = 0$$
 $\Delta_{\emptyset \to q}^{\text{uncap}} \simeq c(1-\rho) \cdot n^{1/\alpha}$

$$\Delta^{\operatorname{cap}}_{q \to u} \simeq c \rho \cdot n^{1/\alpha} \quad \Delta^{\operatorname{uncap}}_{q \to u} \simeq c(g(\alpha, \rho)) \cdot n^{1/\alpha}$$

Research Question

What are the implications of rankings and personalized recommendations in environments with & without supply-side constraints?

